seriously. In 1508, James Grenchalgh was removed from Sheen to Coventry Charterhouse, no longer a professed monk, but a ‘guest’ of the Order, there – or elsewhere – to renew his profession, if any would have him. Grenchalgh came from the Northwest of England, and Coventry Charterhouse did have an external school, which Grenchalgh, as a former schoolmaster in Wells, could obviously have managed. Supplementary evidence of his removal there is to be found in personal annotations to the texts of the Speculum Inclusorium, by an anonymous English Carthusian, and to Rolle’s Parce Mibi Domine in British Library, Royal MS 5.A.7 – a manuscript which also contains a copy of the third book of David of Augsburg’s De Compositione – which had been donated to Coventry Charterhouse by Robert Odyham, who had died there in 1479. Grenchalgh’s annotations in this manuscript have much the same defensive character as those in Emmanuel College MS 35. He has marked, for example, one passage of the Speculum Inclusorium with the ‘JGS’ double monogram that he used for himself and Joanna Sewell.\textsuperscript{34}

Talks occasionis instancia per Dei gracion finaliter victoriam optinebat, et si in pugna spirituali contra temptaciones seu cogitationes illicitas multum fatigatus fuerit aliquis et turbatus labore et timore, tristicia seu dolore, dum tamen non plene consensat in aliquod mortale pecatum: torum hoc exercitium est meritorium, totum confert ad meriti cumulum, totum est occasio magna premii, totum coronas glorie preparat in futuro. (Such perseverance in prayer will finally, by the grace of God, gain victory, and if one is greatly tired by the spiritual battle against temptations or illicit thoughts, and troubled with labour and fear, sadness or pain, while he has not fully consented in any mortal sin, this entire exercise is commendable, it all adds to the accumulation of merit, it is all an occasion of great reward, it all prepares crowns of glory in the future.)

James Grenchalgh seems to have travelled in his exile to a number of the English Charterhouses: annotations in his hand place him, at one time or another, in London and Mount Grace; but he died, still a guest of the Order, in the Charterhouse of Kingston-on-Hull, in 1529. Joanna Sewell died in Syon three years later.

\textsuperscript{34} Sargents, James Grenchalgh, p. 153. For the text of the Speculum Inclusorium see L. Ohler (ed.), Speculum Inclusorium, Auctore anonymo Anglico sacensi xiv, Lateranum n.s. 4, no. 1 (Rome, 1936); the passage cited is on p. 112.
SATURA

a wisdom book that can be traced back to the Hindu *Panchatantra*; it passed from the original Sanskrit into Persian, Turkish, Arabic, and Hebrew. In medieval Europe, however, this specialized schoolbook – a primer for princes – did not circulate widely; it is known only in translations made for three of the great medieval courts: Spain, Rome, and France. It was translated from Arabic into Spanish for Alfonso the Wise in 1251, the year before his coronation. This may well be the version Raymond used for his translation from the Spanish, but he also drew extensively from the *Directorium humanae vitae*, a Latin version of Kalila et Dimna which John of Capua, a converted Jew, translated from the Hebrew sometime after 1263 for Cardinal Matteo Orsini, a nephew of Pope Nicolas III. Raymond reworked both his Spanish and his Latin sources in typical medieval fashion, incessantly amplifying, abridging, selecting, and arranging.

In his preface, Raymond tells us that when Queen Jeanne died in 1305, he laid his translation aside. But he soon took it up again, rededicating it to Philip the Fair. Presenting himself as a tutor, Raymond aimed to offer the king and his family a book filled with philosophical teachings of worth and science, of greater utility to members of court than the vain meanderings of stories about Lancelot and Gawain. But he also hoped that his book would win a place of favor for him in the king's court. In his preface, he speaks of this aspiration in mournfully hopeful tones:

[Cpnm autimabsererem quamplurimum me diu stetisse ... When I noticed how long I stood deplorable and complaining before the king's hall, through spaces of time and times and half-time, not having access or entry to be presented to...]


Calila e Dimna, ed. J. M. Cacho Blecua and M. J. Lacaia, Clásicos Castalia, 133 (Madrid, 1984), who note (17) that a revised version of Calila, ch. I was incorporated into Alfonso's General Estoria (c.1275), Primera Parte, Libro VII, Chap. 41.


Vos nisiter regem curia... (fol. 2v; V: 387-8).

NANCY FREEMAN REGALADO

the royal majesty ... And since I could get no known friends of the king to introduce me to the royal majesty, at least, through the path of knowledge, I could carry out my project and thus appear before the king's face, because it is said by the wise man: *Fortune may endow with good counsel those to whom she denies strength.*

To further his ambition, Raymond undertook preparation of a presentation copy of his book, liberally illustrated with 143 rubricated miniatures and a splendid frontispiece portrait of Philip the Fair and his family: this is the manuscript Paris, BNF MS Lat. 8504. When the illustrated copy of his book was almost finished, Raymond still yearned for glory, still had not been admitted to court. It was therefore decided to link the presentation of his book to a special occasion, the great Parian Pentecost Feast of 1313, which celebrated the knighting of the king's three sons and the taking of crusade vows by kings, nobles, and commoners.

Adjusting his book to the occasion, Raymond made last-minute additions to his completed manuscript. He tipped in two folios: on fol. 4v he copied the preface cited above; on fol. 40v he added the blank recto of fol. 1, pictures...
Regalado 1. Paris BNF, MS. Lat. 8504, fol. 6v. Presentation of Raymond de Béziers' *Kalila et Dimna* to Philip the Fair by Pierre Latilly, chancellor of France and bishop of Châlons-sur-Marne (1313).
SATURA

were glued in that show the knightly, the crusade vow ceremonies, and the grand municipal parade. The last-minute haste of these additions can be felt, for the miniatures are stuck out of order next to the descriptive captions. This ensemble of miniatures in Lat. 8504 is important because this is the earliest known pictorial representation of the events of a historical royal celebration. It includes a picture of the ceremonial presentation of Raymond's book to the king by his patron, Pierre de Latilly, Chancellor of France and bishop of Châlons-sur-Marne (Fig. 1). The physician himself kneels humbly to the right in his scholar's cap and gown. At last we see Raymond where he so longed to be, carried by his book into the presence of the king, 'before the king's face'. We cannot know if this presentation scene records a real event or just wish fulfillment. But whether or not Raymond actually presented his book to the king or not, he surely succeeded in inscribing himself within the pages of Lat. 8504, so that he appears before every reader who opens his book.

In this manuscript, Raymond stages himself in what we may call a tutorial performance: first, he portrays himself as a teacher to the king and amplifies the role of royal adviser; second, he inserts a tutorial programme, a copious number of interpolations into his translation of Kalila et Dimna; third, he creates a book design and page layout that spotlight his additions and his special role as a teacher; finally, he celebrates his illustrious pupils, the royal patrons honoured in his dedication and portrayed in glory in the images of the Pentecost feast of 1313 and in the frontispiece portrait of Philip IV, his brother, and his children (fol. lv-lv).

In the presentation scene of Lat. 8504 and in its dedication, Raymond speaks as a physician who seeks to 'illumine the minds of kings and princes with philosophical teachings, customs, and virtues'. Similar images of a king receiving wise counsel from a physician, philosopher, or teacher recur at every level of Kalila et Dimna. It is found in the outer frame tale, which tells how a physician named Berossius, counselor to the king of Persia, was sent to the mountains of India to seek miraculous herbs said to bring the dead back to life. In India, Berossias sought in vain until wise men explained to him that the mountains were philosophers, herbs their wisdom, and the dead restored to life the ignorant illuminated by knowledge (fol. 13r; V: 417-18). The image of a king and his adviser is found yet again in the inner frame tale where Kalila et Dimna is depicted as one of the books which the physician Berossias is said to have brought back from India to the king of Persia. This inner frame tale represents a dialogue between a certain King Disles and his counsellor Sendebat (called Bidpay in the Arabic tradition), who instructs his king by telling him tales. Moreover, in story after story told by the philosopher Sendebat, a lion king seeks counsel from his animal advisers, as in the story of the title characters, Kalila and Dimna. These are two wolves, jackals in the Arabic tradition, who consider rising in estate by serving the king. Kalila stays at home, avoiding the perils of court; Dimna, on the other hand, is corrupted by power and finally is hanged on the gallows after confessing that he has despoiled the kingdom (fol. 26v-60v; V: 450-533). Finally, in his dedication Raymond himself addresses yet another king, Philip the Fair, who is painted in glory on the opening pages of Lat. 8504.

Raymond announces his own tutorial role at the opening of the preface he added on fol. av (cited above), for he begins with the first three words of the Dialogus Cathonis, the first book which every schoolboy learned by heart

-Cum animadvertenterem quamplurimum-. It was not necessary for him to quote the rest to be understood, for every medieval reader could have supplied from memory the lines from Pseudo-Cato in which Raymond alludes: Cum animadvertenterem quam plerumq... When I noticed how very many go seriously wrong in their manner of living, I decided that they must be helped and counselled so that they might live gloriously and achieve honour.

Indeed, one reader of Lat. 8504 not only recognized the allusion but penned in an approximate version of the citation in the space left blank for the capital C

11 J. G. Alexander cites Lat. 8504 among more than two dozen examples of sticking in parchment patches (Medieval Illuminators and Their Methods of Work (New Haven, CT, 1992), pp. 35-6 and p. 158, n. 12).
12 It is a pleasure to thank A. D. Hedeman, J. J. G. Alexander, and L. F. Sandler for conversations that have illuminated my understanding of the presentation miniatures in Lat. 8504.
13 Per ipsum extra regem possunt et principes philosophici informari documenti, moribus et notis etiam animos illustrare (fol. 2v; V: 387).
14 Raymond calls the physician in the outer frame tale Berossie (from the Spanish Bereduey) or Beroza (following John of Capua's Directorium). Throughout his introduction, Hervieux calls this character Berrozië, the name given him in the 6th-century Persian version (V: 5-6).
15 The tales of Sendebat begin fol. 25 (V: 445f). Translated from Arabic to Hebrew, without diacritic marks, the traditional name Biday was read as Sendebai (Hervieux, V: 18, citing S. de Sacy, Notices et extraits des manuscrits, IX, 4e partie, p. 402). Raymond first calls this counsellor Benoshe, following the Spanish Calida, then Sendebai, following Sendebat in the Latin Directorium.
16 Taylor (p. 197) cites Dimna's confession as one aspect of Raymond's intermittent Christianization of Kalila. On the circulation of this confession at the court of Philip IV, see N. F. Regalado, 'Le Porcher au palais: Kalila et Dimna, Le Roman de Fauvel, Machaut, et Boccace', Etudes Litteraires (forthcoming).
18 Cum animadvertenterem quam plerumq... (cited and translated by Gehl, p. 109 and n. 5).
of Caun on the unfinished fol. av of Raymond’s manuscript.7 Raymond, however, adjusts this tag from Pseudo-Cato to present himself, to set himself in the foreground: ‘[Caun animauesterum quam plurimos me dixit stetisse... When I noticed how very long I stood desolate and complaining before the king’s hall’. Raymond further bolsters his personal role as tutor by sprinkling images of humble counsellors and wise physicians throughout his book. He cites four times more the couplet from the Disticha Catonis that he uses in his preface and which praises the counsel of little men:

Corporis exigui uires contemnere noli;
Consilio pollet cui uim natura negat.30

[Do not disdain little men; Fortune may endow with good counsel those to whom she denies strength.]

He repeats three times another of Pseudo-Cato’s couplets that advises consulting trustworthy doctors:

Consilium archanum tacito com[m]it[t]e sodali;
Corporis auxilium medicum com[m]it[t]e fideli.31

[Consult friends who can keep secrets; confide thy body to a trusted physician.]

Raymond also glorifies his tutorial counterpart in Kalila et Dimna, Berossias, the physician-philosopher of the outer frame tale, by fattening Berossias’s part considerably. Raymond greatly augments the traditional ‘autobiography’ where Berossias tells how he turned from medical science to the art of healing souls; into Berossias’s apostrophe to his soul, Raymond inserts some nine folios of instruction on the cardinal virtues and the two spiritual and five physical senses as well as ‘Summe parentes’, a composition in 194 elegant hexameters which expresses Berossias’s fervent prayers and his dream vision of Paradise, God, and the Virgin (fols 14–22v, V. 420–39). Raymond does not thus mark the importance of teachers in a spirit of sheer self-promotion. His alterations strengthen his educative purpose: the sage tutor tells the king tales in order that he may use the examples and precepts they contain to live well and govern wisely. The presence of the tutor brings such truths home to pupils: writing in about 1300, the Parisian scholar Radulphus Brito said, ‘I rightly contend that we learn more by being taught than we find through our own efforts, for one lesson heard is of more profit than ten lessons read privately. ... What you hear from another person is

sitting deeper in your mind than what you learn by yourself.32

In what sense can we say that Raymond ‘teaches’ Kalila et Dimna in his manuscript? There are three approaches a medieval tutor might take in teaching such a work inherited from ancient and pagan times. First, he could offer a detailed gloss to ensure comprehension and to build mental and moral sophistication: construing, summarizing, amplifying, reinventing the primary text.33 Second, he could elaborate an interpretive allegorical commentary, building a Christian moral edifice upon the pagan foundation. Third, he could point up moral lessons by means of maxims and citations from the auctores.

Raymond glosses only one of his citations, the passage in hexameters, ‘Summe parentes’, taken from the Anticludianus of Alain of Lille and inserted into the speech of the physician-philosopher Berossias:34 Raymond stresses the special doctrinal status of these verses – and his own role as teacher – by writing one to six lines of explicative commentary in a small hand between the verses, and underlining glossed terms in red ink.

Summe parentes, eterno Deus vivensque potentas,
Summe contra quem nichil parent, qui non tua creatur et sine fine, den in mortalis vivens a quo omnis uita. potestas a quo procedit potestatem.35

This, however, is the only passage of his book that is so glossed. The path of knowledge, the via scientiae of which Raymond speaks in his preface (cited above), is not a speculative philosophy but practical and moral wisdom whose truth is tested and proved by the exemplary fables.36 At no


8 See Gebel’s rich descriptions of moral-grammatical reading and teaching in the elementary classrooms of trecento Florence (pp. 149–50 and passim).


10 Fol. 19v: V. 433; gloss transcribed by E. A. R. Brown.

11 Gebel summarizes the aim of reading works such as collections of pagan animal fables in the elementary grammar curriculum: ‘Wisdom in this context is the ability to make moral decisions in everyday life, and to do so by analyzing situations in terms of moral categories absorbed through reading and study, that is, Latin study’ (p. 197). In their excellent introduction, Cacho Blecua and Lacarra emphasize the practical goal of Kalila et Dimna: to teach princes and rulers to apply general rules to particular situations (pp. 21–2).
point does Raymond attempt Christianizing allegorical commentary of the Oriental fables themselves. Instead, to the unflinchingly pragmatic secular advice of the animal fables, Raymond added lessons for his audience of Christian princes, working in three extended dissertations on the virtues, on the seven deadly sins, and on the art of royal counsel. Raymond does not attempt to elaborate a political treatise like Gilles de Rome's influential *De regimine principum* composed for Philip the Fair in 1279. Instead his *Kaiila et Dinna* promotes the value of good advice; a dozen of his nineteen chapters represent a king asking his advisers for practical counsel in matters of governing:

King Dides said to the philosopher Sendeolete: 'I have heard your fable and your teaching; but give me now a fable and teaching about what happens between kings and their companions and counselors, when they become angry with someone and then bring him back from disgrace and their indignation fades away and favor is restored, after they have tested and examined him with many and various affictions and whippings.'

Raymond interpolates a lengthy dissertation on royal counsel and the art of war, attributing it to a long-winded crow in the 'Fable of The War between the Crows and the Starlings'. This is not an astoundingly irrelevant intrusion, as Léopold Hervieux, Raymond's nineteenth-century editor, believed (omitting some eleven folios of the text from his edition). Rather it is an instructive elaboration of themes central to *Kaiila et Dinna*: the art of counselling kings. Raymond's ethical precepts are not addressed to a general public across the social classes, as was the popular *Moralium dogna philosophorum* attributed to Guillaume de Conches, but rather to a specific group of readers: the members of the royal family and their advisers. In his dedication, Raymond speaks of governmental matters that concern only kings: 'From what conditions of men he should choose seneschals, bailiffs, judges, notaries, officers, and others necessary to serve in the court of the

Royal Majesty'.

Raymond prefers to teach not through gloss or allegory but through authoritative maxims and citations. In the elaborate table of contents incorporated into his *Premium*, he says that he offers *documenta sub exemplis*, that is, illustrative stories with teaching: fables, verse citations, images, and maxims from the sages and philosophers that bring out the letter and intention of the author:

The first chapter of this book is about the works and intentions of ancient philosophers and their general and specific lessons; within which are found illustrative stories with teaching [lit. proof tests] - fables, metrical verse, and figures through which the author's intention and the clear meaning of what is written is made manifest ... And within this [chapter] are fifty verses of maxims corresponding to the requirements of the subject matter with many citations from wise men and philosophers.

The fables offer cases: Raymond's task is to show his reader how to draw on a store of maxims to interpret such situations and eventually to use them to guide his own conduct. He therefore supplies his reader with a vast programme of what he calls *addiciones*, a *florilegium* of hundreds of moral maxims in verse and prose, which Raymond describes in his dedication.

To this book I added verses, proverbs, citations, and other things that I could remember, so that in the book the reader could gaze on them, and these additions I decided should be written in red ink, so that they could be distinguished from the ancient book.

These *addiciones*, together with Raymond's voluminous interpolations on the vices, virtues, and royal counsel, nearly double the length of the original fable collection. They are the heart of Raymond's tutorial performance; they are taken from his memory store. Like every pedagogue, he

---

27 *Ait rex Bilel [= Dides] philosophe Sendeolete: 'Audisci tuam parabolam et doctrinam; sed de melius none parabolam et doctrinam de loc quod accidit inter reges et eorum consilii et consules, quando contra aliquem indignans et post modum ab illo reconcilians et eorum indignationis illius et dilectionis voluntatis, postquam illum apprehensus et examinaverunt multis et moribus afflictionibus et flagellis.' (fol. 138v; V: 709).

28 Lat. 8504, fols 84v-95v; Hervieux lists the 22 rubrics that articulate this interpolated treatise on royal counsel such as: *De justificatione utendi in consiliis, De secreto non propagando nisi pro necessitate vel utilitate, De non ostendo voluntatem suam in consiliis, De consilio ab aliis petendo, Quorum consilium debet sitare, De niutandro consilio iliorem, qui sunt vel iam fuerant inimici, sed postea in gregam redierunt, etc.* (V: 599-600, n. 4). On the place of this interpolation in the council of the starlings, see Hervieux, V: 598-9, and Taylor, p. 195.

29 Taylor shows that themes 'dear to the *Speculum principum*' are expanded in Raymond as in the Persian and Turkish versions, but attenuated in the Hebrew, Spanish and Arabic versions (pp. 196-97).

30 *Premium buius libri capitulum est de conditionibus antiquorum philosophorum et intencionibus eorum documentisque in generali et in speciali; sub quo continuerunt documenta sub exemplis — fabulis, metris et figuris per quam sensibiliter actu intendo et litterae declarato manifestator ... Et sub uto sunt quasquegentas versus proverbiales secundum exigencias materie cum autoritatibus quassantibus sapienciae et philosophorum.* (fol. 2v; V: 380).

31 *In quo quidem libro additi versus, proverbia, autoritatis et alia secundum propositam memoriam, prout in ipso libro lector potius intueri, dictaque additiones ducti per rubrum, ut ab ipso libro antiquo discerni natali, conscribendarit* (fol. 2v; V: 338).

32 Hervieux, V: 40, 58.
amplifies and explains his primary material, as he says in his Pronemion, so that 'the clear meaning of what is written is made manifest'. He points up his lessons, continues, with pithy sayings 'corresponding to the requirements of the subject matter' and citations from Biblical and classical auctores, 'wise men and philosophers', that legitimize the wisdom dispensed by these extra-canonical tales.

Now many medieval works incorporate maxims: what is the difference between writing and teaching in Kalila et Dimna? In a culture founded on memoria and inventio, where readers and authors alike think within a vast network of intertextual recollections, virtually any composition might be troubled with proverbs, maxims, and citations: a work such as the Moralisom dogma philosophorum of Guillaume de Conches is a compendium of excerpts from pagan authors in prose and verse. Teaching, in contrast with writing, uses citation to explain or confirm the truth of an existing text. Such citations may appear in writing in interlinear or marginal glosses, or they may be incorporated into the body of the original: Sanson de Nantuil's mid-twelfth-century bilingual Proverbes de Salomon, for example, makes his translation of the Book of Proverbs a 'moral textbook' by adding thousands of lines of commentary including maxims and citations from the auctores. Like Raymond, Don Juan Manuel, prince royal and nephew of Alfonso the Wise, also added maxims and moral doctrine to his collection of exemplary tales, the celebrated Libro del Conde Lucanor (1335). He appended to his book of stories three chapters containing respectively one hundred, fifty, and thirty sentencias, which he called proverbs, and a final chapter of doctrinal exposition. Although he fitted these within the same framing fictional dialogue (between Count Lucanor and his adviser Patron) as his exemplar, Juan Manuel used word play and jumbled word order to make the maxims increasingly difficult to understand, saying that his friend Don Jaime de Riva wished 'that his books would speak more obscurely' to enhance their 'wisdom'.


NANCY FREEMAN REGALADO

Raymond's undertaking to fit out Kalila et Dimna with an anthology of moral maxims and disquisitions is, therefore, not unique. It is, however, unusual in two respects: first, in the range of his ambitious programme of citations; and second, in Raymond's concern that every reader should be able to distinguish his additiones from the 'ancient book'. The range of Raymond's citations is strikingly restricted: they are drawn largely from works that his readers would have very likely memorized in the grammar curriculum – the Disticha Catonis; the Yospe; and anthologies of moral commonplace from antiquity, the Bible, the Church Fathers, and a couple of twelfth-century 'classics', the Pamphilius and Gautier de Châtillon's Alexandreis (1176).

No single work provided Raymond with more maxims than the Disticha Catonis, the late Latin compendium of moral commonplace which was the first reader for all who undertook Latin. 'Cato dixit...: his name appears more than three dozen times in Raymond's Kalila et Dimna. About one-third of the distichs are cited, some repeated as many as two, three, or even five times at some six dozen locations. Seneca, Ovid, Cicero, and Horace are also summoned to contribute sayings in prose and verse, gathered 'secondum propositionem memoriam', from Raymond's memory; perhaps he drew too from one of the medieval florilegia typically organized by topic, author, or text. Raymond also cites more than three dozen elegiac distichs from Yospe, a popular collection of fables in the Romanus tradition, attributed to Walter the
SATURA

Englishman, tutor of William II at the Norman court of Sicily (c.1175). Finally, Raymond harvested Bible proverbs and verses, principally from the wisdom books of the Old Testament, Proverbs, Psalms, Ecclesiastes, and Ecclesiasticus, whose sober realism suits the pragmatic tone of his fables.

Raymond draws prose and verse passages indiscriminately from all these sources, as can be seen in an extended sample from the ‘Fable of the Dove, the Mouse, the Crow, the Tortoise, and the Stag’: (fol. 71v: V: 565-66). To facilitate perception of how Raymond worked in his addicitiones: Raymond’s prose additions are in italics; his verse citations (copied in red ink in Lat. 8504) are in boldface; names of auctor cited are capitalized; and sources cited by Hervieux are indicated in brackets (fol. 71v: V: 565). 33


Quale sit id quod amas, celeri circumspice mente,
Et tua leuto subtrahe colla iugio. [Remedias amoris, vv. 89-90]

Et SAPIENS dixit: Si posisse amicus, in temptatione posse [Ecclesiasticus 5.7], Et PHILOPHOSA solentem amicos Des fieri et scient amicos probatos meliorem alis, forte dixit: Proba me, Domine, et tempus et eum uere meos et

33 Ed. Hervieux, I: 472-677, II: 316-91. Raymond’s clear exposition of story and moral stand in marked contrast to the dense language of Walter’s fables; Gehl’s students to the political value of Walter’s ‘teleological’ versions of fables that required students to master ‘wordplay of a subtle and sometimes treacherous sort’, thereby learning how language could be used to evil ends (pp. 122, 125).

34 Analysis of a single page in ch. 1 reveals a similar pattern. On fol. 12 (V: 412-4), some ten anonymous sayings are blended with nine citations from Ovid, Seneca, and Martial, Ecclesiasticus and Romans, Walter the Englishman and Pampelus, five attributed by Raymond himself to their authors. Some 64 citations may be distinguished in ch. 1 (fols 10-13; V: 405-16), counting insertions found only in BN MS Lat. 8504 (and not in BN MS Lat. 8505) and identified by Raymond’s attributions, Hervieux’s notes and typographic layout (material found only in BN MS Lat. 8504 is set in smaller type), or by markers such as verse form, red underlining, or introductory phrases such as kathai illud or Vnde dixit sapiens which are used for both prose and verse maxims. Although there are some 40 prose citations and only 24 in verse, these are approximately equal in volume since the verse insertions are often longer. Verse seems more readily identified than prose: of the 24 verse insertions, 9 bear attribution by Raymond and 10 more are identified by Hervieux; only 5 remain unidentified. In contrast, more than half of the 40 prose citations have not been identified; one-third have attributions by Raymond and four were identified by Hervieux.

35 Author names float on the surface of this great flood of commonplace without altering its direction; Raymond thus joins in the immense conversation that is medieval moral discourse. Like the authors of the florilegium and the Moraliae domus philosophorum, Raymond often seems to disregard the full context of origin of his sentences; whatever their source, his maxims reflect the same commonplace morality of prudent conduct. The half-dozen platitudes which he cites elsewhere from the Pampelus, an elegantly cynical tale of seduction and rape from the late twelfth century, are indistinguishable from the dozen taken from Gautier de Châtillon’s heroic epic, the Alexsandros (c.1176).

However, citations from other fables – a staple of the elementary curriculum – surely thickened and enriched the texture of Kallia et Dimna by prompting recollection of other stories. In the ‘Fable of the Dove’, cited above, Raymond quotes Walter’s ‘Fable of the Dog and the Ass’:

Dixit mans: Non est tanta germania in acquisita malicia et odio, sicut in haeque radicibus non naturalibus producuntur, - quid dicitur: Quod natura negat, tollere nemo potest [fol. 62; V: 359. Walter the Englishman, Fable XVII, v. 15; Hervieux II: 324].

Raymond makes little attempt, however, to combine the story matter of the Ysopus tradition with his own. Instead, the couplets he inserts are almost always taken, as here, from the moral of the fable he is quoting. 36 If the

36 Into his ‘Fable of the Dog and his Shadow’, Raymond inserts the moral of Walter’s version of the same story (fol. 23v; V: 441), citing Walter’s Fable V, vv. 5-6 (Hervieux, II: 318).

37 Only one maxim, cited twice, is taken from the body of a fable (fols 44v, 6v; V: 494, 764; Walter, Fable III, v. 3-4, ed. Hervieux, II: 317). The 36 couplets Raymond cites are taken from only 17 of the 62 fables in Walter’s collection; twice he makes a couplet out of verses from different fables (fols 31v, 46v: V: 461, 498). The couplet Raymond cites from Baldo, an Italian poet who apparently rhymed some of the fables of John of Caspa in leonine hexameters, is also taken from the moral of Baldo’s ‘Fable of the War of the Crows and the Owls’ but cited in Raymond’s ‘Fable of the Lion and the Bull’ (fol. 37; V: 473; Baldo, Fable XI, ed. Hervieux, V: 352).
association between fable and moral was very strong, these citations could call up other stories from the reader's memory. At the very least they associate 
Kalila et Dimna with the prestige of Ysoyaes and give readers the pleasure of linking the fable traditions of East and West.

Raymond's editor Hervieux judged all these addiciones to be clumsy interruptions inserted without regard for story line or the logic of dialogue; he thought they were added not by Raymond but by some 'very devout, very erudite monk' in a spirit of 'Christian propaganda'. The moralizing nature of the stories themselves, however, laid them open to whatever Raymond chose to add. Moreover, Kalila et Dimna is composed throughout in first-person speech; characters in the fables become storytellers in their turn. Even the Seven Deadly Sins speak for themselves in Raymond's tree of Vices, a handsome mnemonic figure on fol. 59v, where each Vice describes her own qualities and effects in a single line inscribed in a round medallion from which branches out a pair of four-line groups of descriptive phrases which are also cast in first-person speech:

Superbia
Cetera quae supero me noet transcendere volo. ...

Invidia.
Prospera cum auro, poteris invidiae... 

Ira.
Nulla fugit dira mea ment, cum sers et in ira. (531–3)

It was easy for Raymond to put quotations in mouths of characters who were already well launched into moral reflection. It surely delights every reader to hear the familiar maxim from Walter's 'Fable of the Dog and the Ass' (cited above in Latin) when it is put into the mouth of a sententious mouse:

The mouse said, 'There is not so much evil in acquired malice and hatred as in those things that grow from natural roots', — whence it is said:
What Nature denies, no one can teach.

Raymond's teaching does not take the form of annotations copied in the margins like a learned gloss. Instead he incorporates his store of maxims into the stories themselves and attributes them — in direct discourse — to the characters of the fables, as in the 'Fable of the Dove' (cited above) where mice, crows, and stags cite Martial, Ovid, Ecclesiasticus, Solomon, and Seneca. All of Raymond's insertions are thus 'voiced', and this is part of their memorable charm. Most importantly, by inscribing his addiciones into the fables themselves and in a particular format, Raymond ensured that his own tutorial performance would be repeated and noticed at every reading.

On the page layout of Lat. 8504, see P. Bourguin, 'Les contes', Mise en page et mise en texte du livre manuscrit, II-J. Martin, J. Vezin (eds), (Paris, 1993), pp. 162–3, and no. 101 (Lat. 8504, fol. 34v), showing the layout of the red-ink verse insertions. Where the name of an auctor appears in the body of the prose, the initial is also touched with red.

Many other mistakes were left uncorrected (Bourguin, p. 163; Hervieux, V: 73–4).

Bourguin, p. 163. I am grateful to S. Cochis for pointing out that a 15th-century pedagogue, Antoine de la Salé — tutor to Jean de Calabre, son of René d'Anjou — specified a comparable layout in his autograph instructions in a manuscript of his Petit Jehan de Saintré (Paris, BN F 15892, fol. 105v), correcting the didactic passages of his romance, Antoine specified that the Latin citations — verse and prose alike — should be indented and copied in red ink (Antoine de la Salé's Delightful Teachings: Literature and Learning in his Late Medieval Books for Princes', unpublished Ph.D. thesis, New York University (1998)).
fables each containing, illustrations too were counted in the table of contents but only for the first five chapters.

And this chapter (III) contains nine figures and six fables... And there are also in this chapter 233 verses and several lessons in moral philosophy extracted and gathered from diverse books of the auctores and wine philosophers. When these are understood and applied, we will all be well able to make our way to the heavenly land above.  

While stories may be numbered in tables of contents and songs in chaussonniers are sometimes indexed by folio number, it is unusual indeed to find a tally of verse insertions in a table. The exceptional rubrication, layout,

The table is copied on fols 2v-9v; V: 386-404. Hervieux signals discrepancies between the tally of fables in the table and the number in the chapters (V: 62-3). The counting of verses too is approximate: for example, the table (cited above) lists fifty verses in Chapter 1 compared to 56 in the chapter.

Most commonly, a count of verses and fables appears at the end of each summary of topics and fables: for example, ch. 6, Et in sub capite versus c. 150, fabule x (fols. 9v; V: 402). The table even notes when a chapter contains no verses, as in ch. 17, Et in sub capite versus nolit continentur fabule x (fols. 9v; V: 402). Even the absence of illustrative illuminations, fables, and verses is noted, as in ch. 2, Nusta figura, nulla fabula, nullos versus (fols. 3v; V: 389). Fables and figures but not verses are present throughout the margin of Lat. 8504 by the rubricator, probably as a memo for payment, rather than as a visual aid to the reader (Bourgain, p. 163).

Else, see J. G. Alexander, Medieval Illuminators and Their Methods of Work (New Haven, CT, 1992), pp. 165-6, n. 41 and n. 48. The chapter-by-chapter tallies of illuminations in the table of Lat. 8504 may be compared with the brief total recorded in Paris, Bibliothèque de l'Arсенал MS 3516, a 13th-century didactic compilation, whose index ends with the notation: Cbat sunt scriptae versus montes ilia a d'or et de color. Des figures d'or i a il LX, et des figures de color i a il IIIinst XIII (fols. 3v).

Et sub sub capite nosse figure sexque fabule continentur. ... Sunt autem in sub capite ccccxx versus, plerisque documentis moralis astutia et collecta ex diversis libris d'actorum et sapientum philosophorum. Quibus intellectus et operi applicati, potest quod omnes ad celestem patriam pervenire supernovarum (fols. 3v-4; V: 389-90).


Although lyric-narrative compositions were popular throughout the 13th and 14th centuries, Raymond's decision to set verse interpolations within a pre-existing narrative frame is actually quite remarkable. There are only a handful of analogies: the 'Strange Ludos supers Anticlaudismum' of Adam de la Basée (c.1280), the refrain inserted into a 13th-century French translation of Ovid's Art of Love, and the version of the Roman de Fauvel in BN MS Fr. 146 (1317); see E. Roemen, F. Avril, and N. F. Regalado, 'Introduction', Le Roman de Fauvel in the index of Lat. 8504 all contribute to make the verse additions stand out. The unusual and systematic tailing in Raymond's table of contents points to the significance he attributed to each element in his 'composition' - the 'fables, metrical verse, and figures through which the author's intention and the clear meaning of what is written are made manifest' (see above, note 30).

These red-ink verse insertions tallied in the table of Lat. 8504 and laid out so carefully on its pages mark a significant shift in the balance between story and sententia in Raymond's Kalila et Dimna, for rubrication of lyric insertions is a rare phenomenon. Pascale Bourgain suggests that the contrasts


While red-ink is commonly used to articulate divisions of a work, to distinguish words to be spoken from the script of processional movements (as in a coronation order), or to distinguish text from gloss, I have found only a few examples of red-ink verse insertions. I am grateful to M. Bolton and A. Butterfield for their letters citing examples: red-ink songs written out like prose (as was customary for songs) but without music, in Gerbert de Monteurel, Le Roman de la violette (Paris, BNF MS fr. 1374); a single red-ink rondel in Jean le Court (Brussels), Le Retour du pauvre (Paris BNF, MS fr. 1554, fol. 158); red-ink copies of a Belle Asse sermon (Paris, Bibliothèque de l'Arsenal MS 3142 and BNF MS fr. 12467); a red-ink farce by Watriquet de Coumons (Paris, BNF MS fr. 14968, fol. 162). E. Roemen kindly pointed out two instances where red-ink was used to distinguish vernacular lyrics from their Latin alternatives: the English text of the celebrated canon Summer is icon on in Londe sing cescce (London, B.L. Harley 978, fol. 11v) imprinted in red in the margin next to some Latin motets to cross-reference pieces with the same musical setting, in Wolfenbüttel, Herzog August Bibliothek, MS 1099 Helmsted. In a manuscript of the Histoire ancienne jusqu'à César written in prose and verse, verse is made to stand out by rubrication of initials and red line ornaments (R. Blumenfeld-Kosinski, 'Moralization and History: Verse and Prose in the Histoire ancienne jusqu'à César (in B.N.Fr. 21225)', Zeitschrift für romanische Philologie, 97 (1981), p. 46). Finally, I thank K. A. Duys for her letter that reported red-ink Latin citations inserted into a French prose chronicle, Chroniques de France en français depuis la destruction de Troie jusqu'au siège de
in Kalila et Dimna — black and red, narrative and commentary, prose and verse — emphasize the opposition of eastern and classical wisdom; but the treatise overlooks the abundant interpolations of classical and Biblical prose maxims which are blended seamlessly into the prose copied in black ink.69 Red ink was commonly used to guide readers’ understanding; it serves to orient the reader’s eye, revealing the order of a work through rubrics. Thus in the treatise on counsel which Raymond interpolates into the ‘Fable of the War between the Crows and the Starlings’, the main points are summarized in rubrics (see above, note 8); throughout Lat. 8504 red tituli identify the miniatures, which illustrate narrative themes rather than the moral precepts of the fables. Red ink could also be used to mark texts surrounded by glosses in some manuscripts, that is, readers’ commentaries on fully institutionalized texts such as the Bible, canon law, and certain classical authors.62 Kalila et Dimna, however, has no such institutional value; it is marginal to the great stream of prestigious works which the European West inherited from antiquity and which were incessantly glossed. Raymond’s red-ink additioones to Kalila et Dimna, moreover, are not arranged like interpretive glosses set around a canonical text. Instead they are centred in the columns of text on the page, where they bear the weight of authority. By multiplying these wise sayings throughout the fables and magnifying those in verse by his page layout, Raymond reorders the expressive priorities of Kalila et Dimna. He gives his sententiae great prominence; they are the wisdom contained in the fables, which serve as curious mnemonic images. Memory is here, as everywhere, inseparable from the formation of moral virtues.63 Delightful stories, memorable red-ink colour, and alternations between verse and prose thus work together in Lat. 8504 to fix nuggets of wisdom in the reader’s mind.”

---

NANCY FREEMAN REGALADO

The nature and arrangement of this large repertory of maxims drawn from the staples of the school curriculum confirm its purpose in Raymond’s royal book. He does not seek to display learning but to educate a prince: he does not choose citations outside the elementary curriculum, nor does he elaborate commentary on those prestigious auctores from the university curriculum who so delighted his contemporary, Jean de Meun; he cites no Virgil, no Boethius, no Aristotle; he reflects no trace of scientific, political, or intellectual controversy. But, although the stories and lavish illustrations of Lat. 8504 would surely please youthful readers, Raymond’s book itself is not elementary in nature. Written in prose, it does not lend itself to memorization by children but to reading and consideration by adults who could each call up from his own memory many of the inserted verses. This is the ‘pedagogy of recognition’ of which Paul Gehl speaks; the internal authority of texts engraved on the memory for life.71 Raymond uses his maxims to reinforce at every point the educational purpose of Kalila et Dimna itself: the lesson in kingship. He hearkens back to the auctores and Scripture of the elementary curriculum to set forth moral lessons that will enable the king to exercise his great powers wisely. Exported into these foreign tales, these familiar sentences provide a pleasurable shock of recognition that reinforces home truths. Endlessly repeated throughout life, the sayings learned in childhood grow in significance with age. The opening chapter of Kalila et Dimna repeats this familiar medieval view of elementary education:

And the ancient philosophers were moved by three reasons to explain their meanings by exemplary stories: first, because what is set forth by means of such stories is more clearly understood and, by reason of the wonder they evoke, they remain longer and are more deeply rooted in memory; second, because the prudence of the philosophers is augmented when it is set out in a fustiliegium of maxims and exempla; third, because the many words of such stories give such pleasure to children that they are rooted deep into memory, so that when they reach a weightier age, they will take the sweetest fruit out of the hard shell; they will understand their proper meaning. And no treasure can be compared to such meaning.

Whoever, therefore, has read this book through, not for its words but for intrinsic understanding, should apply his mind so he will not be like someone who wants to eat nuts without taking them out of the shell or like a young schoolboy learning grammar who puts the parts of speech in his heart but does not grasp the underlying meaning. And it is useless to learn this knowledge unless what one learns and understands is put into practice.”

---


‘Les contes’, p. 163.


Carruthers, p. 156.

64 The alternation between prose and verse in Kalila et Dimna is by no means as fully orchestrated as in other classics of the school curriculum such as Prosper of Aquitaine’s Epigrammata, his digest of St. Augustine, or Boethius’s Consolation; see Gehl, pp. 68–9 (Fig. 4), 137–42, and 153–8.

---

120

55 A Moral Art, pp. 189, 108.

66 Et monobantur tribus rationibus ut suas intentiones exemplis seminibus explicarent: primo, quia quod declarator sub exemplis talibus clarior intelligitur, et ratione admirationis discuss in memoria permanet et in ea forcis radicatur; secundo, quia multiplicatur philosophorum [sic] prudencia, cum cogitationem suis valentiam sententiam
SATURA

Raymond's dynamic tutorial performance uses the fables of *Kalila et Dimna* to recall for his princely readers a rich store of lessons memorized in youth. His work demonstrates how maxims from the earliest schoolbooks were integrated into a curriculum that was fundamentally cumulative in nature. Primers with which children learned to read provided a moral foundation whose essentials were not outgrown or laid aside in later years but continued to serve three purposes. First, Raymond's *addiciones* show how familiar sayings from the earliest schoolbooks were cited in order to guide pupils towards understanding of unfamiliar works such as *Kalila et Dimna*. Second, as Raymond says, home truths were confirmed and more deeply understood when recognized in new contexts. Finally, Raymond declares, 'It is useless to learn this knowledge unless what one learns and understands is put into practice.' Raymond puts his own learning into practice by setting his *addiciones* within the fables so that the animal characters might teach his glorious pupils, by example and maxim, how to apply moral principles learned in childhood as a guide to adult life and the craft of kingship.

Personal Note

It is a pleasure to thank several colleagues whose tutorial skills increased my understanding of Raymond of Béziers's *Kalila et Dimna*. I have benefited greatly from studying Lat. 8504 with the historian E. A. R. Brown in the context of our work on the Parisian Pentecost Feast of 1313; I am most warmly grateful for her codicological descriptions of this manuscript, her transcription of several passages of Raymond's *Kalila et Dimna* not edited by Hervieux, and her translations from the Latin cited here. M. J. Carruthers, R. Copeland, and T. F. X. Noble provided me an opportunity to present this paper before an audience knowledgeable in the Arabic, Spanish, and English fable traditions at one of the sessions on 'Elementary Education in the Middle Ages: Literacy, Numeraly, Artisanry', sponsored by the Medieval Academy of America at the 30th International Congress on Medieval Studies (Western Michigan University, 4 May 1995). I thank Sahar Amer for her comments on the Arabic tradition and both M. Carruthers and R. Raymo for our invaluable examples sensibilibus adaptare; tercio, quia poesi admirati, in exemplis talibus congruidenter, dicta locutoria cum quaedam deflectione in memoria radicabunt, ut, cum statem ponderov蟊rum perseverent, de dora testa fractum dulcisimum edentes, sensum capiant aportosum; et nullus suusius buic sensui potest concupiri. Quid ergo librum istum perlegit non ad dicta extrinsecus, sed ad intellectum intrinsecum debet autem applicare ut non [sit] simul solent [nuces] conedere non aperas, et poero nullo loco tam inueniendum addiscendi, qui partes cordiles aghat sententiam ignorantis, et cognitio hisus scientiae erit invitas, nisi quod quis dediscet et intelleget, ducet ad effectum (fol. 19 V. 405-6).
SATURA

Studies in Medieval Literature
in honour of
ROBERT R. RAYMO
edited by
NANCY M. REALE
and
RUTH E. STERNGLANTZ

SHAUN TYAS
DONINGTON
2001