

BOOK REVIEWS

P.W. Pestman et al., *Greek and Demotic Texts from the Zenon Archive* (P.L. Bat. 20). Papyrologica Lugduno-Batava XX. Leiden, E.J. Brill, 1980, pp. xvi + 291, 30 plates in a separate fascicle. Hfl. 240.

This volume is essentially a byproduct of a much larger project, namely the preparation of the *Guide to the Zenon Archive* which is to appear in 1981 as Pap.Lugd.Bat. XXI. Like the *Guide*, the present book is the work of an international team headed by Pestman and including Willy Clarysse, the late Michel Muszynski, W.J. Tait, and J.K. Winnicki. There are smaller contributions also by Tony Reekmans, Annette Schutgens, and Zaki Aly. Each contributor has written in his language of choice (Pestman in Italian, Muszynski in French, Winnicki in German, the others in English).

The cosmopolitan flavor imparted by this format is well-matched by the heterogeneity of the contents. Part I (nos. 1-13) consists of the bilingual receipts of the Zenon archive (i.e., all of the bilingual texts except one letter), Part II (nos. 14-75) a potpourri of Greek texts from the same archive reedited here for various reasons, and Part III a half-dozen texts related to the archive but not part of it. These last are designated by the letters A-F, an unhappy expedient. Part I has an index separate from that of Parts II and III, a reflection of its having been prepared before the larger project began. Given the coherence of this section, the choice to keep the separate index is understandable if not wholly felicitous; the *Guide* will in any case, one gathers, replace large parts of the index of this and other Zenon volumes.

Part I is a reuniting of Greek and Demotic parts of the same papyri, originally published separately (the Demotic of 12 was previously unpublished). It is marked throughout by that extraordinary ambidexterity in Greek and Demotic which marks Pestman's work; the detailed indices display the pains taken to show equivalences in the two languages. The material itself is, though somewhat dry document by document, very revealing in the aggregate of the internal

administration of Apollonios' estate and its relationship to state functionaries. In particular there is valuable light shed on the use of Egyptian scribes to produce a version of a basic Greek text which would be understandable to a native. The uncommon appearance of Egyptians working as gardeners in a vineyard (no.3) is also interesting. Pestman provides a relatively brief (in view of the *Guide*) general introduction which is nonetheless very helpful in placing these bilingual texts in the general context of the Zenon archive. A handy chart (opposite p.9) of the relationship among Egyptian, financial, and Macedonian years from 259-253 will also save headaches or constant reference to Pestman's *Chronologie égyptienne*.

The papyri in Part II have in common only that they were not previously available in one of the major Zenon volumes (*PSI*, *P.Col.*, *P.Cair.Zen.*, *P.Mich.*, *P.Lond.*) in a satisfactory edition. Some, therefore, are here because too many corrections to the *editio princeps* have been published to allow reference to it in the *Guide* without a burdensome baggage of footnotes. Others are essentially revised texts published in articles by other scholars. Still more come from smaller collections (this is a kind of *Sammelbuch* with commentary) which have only a few Zenon papyri. The concordance lists 14 collections and 34 publications. In all of these there are two principal gains: the convenience of reference to up-to-date editions in one volume; and a good commentary based on the resources of the *Guide*. All of the principal contributors to this section have done a good job on the introductions and notes and deserve our gratitude. Cleaning up the untidiness of the last 60 years or so cannot have been, in most cases, a very exciting business, and in some instances the advance on individual pieces is very slight. It is their collection which is useful.

There are, beyond this, a number of cases where the collaborators have made important new joins of scattered fragments, leading in some to significant discoveries. As these are presented without much fanfare on the editor's part, it is appropriate to celebrate a few of them here. 32 (Tait) is made up of *P.Lond.* VII 1931, in which Skeat had already incorporated *P.Col.Zen.* II 115g and *P.Cair.Zen.* I 59017, and *P.Col.Zen.* II 61. It yields now a new *terminus post quem* for Zenon's departure from Palestine. 38 (Clarysse and Tait) again takes a previous join, of *PSI* VI 639 and *P.Col.Zen.* II 114j (by Van 't Dack) and adds *P.Col.Zen.* II 78. We learn a good deal more about the propor-

tion of uncultivable land in the holdings of two veterans (cf. p. 158). 51 (Winnicki) joins *P.Iand.* VI 92 and *PSI* IV 340 with an unpublished Cairo fragment to give a virtually complete text of the letter of Hierokles to Artemidoros about the gymnastic trainer Ptolemaios.

Of the commentaries, I may single out Tait's important discussion of 50 (*PSI* IV 328), the text about the Hesis cow, where Tait argues that the letter refers to bringing the body of the cow back from another nome to Aftih. Though this view is not totally free of difficulty, Tait makes a persuasive case for it against Edgar and Hunt's view that the new Hesis is meant.

Part III is meant more for convenience than dramatic improvements, but Pestman provides a very detailed commentary to A (*P.Lille* 1) and Clarysse revises *P.Petr.* II 13 (5) very extensively as C.

The plates vary in quality according to their sources but are generally good and well-chosen. There is no scale but they are nearly full-sized. The separate fascicle is convenient to use with the volume but awkward to store or bind because of its 24 x 34 cm. format. Brill's price of 240 guilders will not strike many academics as reasonable for a subsidized book, however handsomely printed.

This volume, then, suffers from a certain amount of disjointedness and disunity, but these are no greater than in many volumes of papyri and are in any event far outweighed by its numerous merits: a convenient collection of scattered texts, some major advances in archival reconstruction, good and sometimes distinguished commentaries, thorough and sensitive indexing, and useful photographic documentation. The contributors deserve our congratulations; and we look with anticipation to the *Guide*.

Columbia University

Roger S. Bagnall

Elsa Gibson, *The "Christians for Christians" Inscriptions of Phrygia*, Harvard Theological Studies XXXII, Scholars Press, Missoula, 1978, pp. xiii + 160, 33 plates. \$ 7.50.

In northern Phrygia the mountains east of Aezani define a high plain some 25 kilometers long, fertile and watered to excess by the ancient Tembris river which, traversing the valley, passes north to descend to Cotyaeum, the nearest significant city. In the Upper Tembris valley were farm lands and villages, owned in part by the