

American Classical League

Review

Reviewed Work(s): *The Greek City States: A Source Book* by P. J. RHODES

Review by: ROGER S. BAGNALL

Source: *The Classical Outlook*, Vol. 65, No. 3 (MARCH-APRIL 1988), p. 104

Published by: American Classical League

Stable URL: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/43935334>

Accessed: 12-06-2017 14:52 UTC

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of the Terms & Conditions of Use, available at

<http://about.jstor.org/terms>



American Classical League is collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *The Classical Outlook*

one consonant is short" and that "a syllable containing a short vowel followed by more than one consonant . . . is long." This is quite true for someone counting letters on a printed page, but, for someone *hearing* a hexameter *correctly syllabified*, a syllable in which a short vowel is not followed by a consonant *within the syllable* is short, and a syllable in which a short vowel is followed by one or more consonants *within the syllable* is long. This may be easily deduced (ancient evidence apart) from the fact that the first syllable of *agrum* may be either short or long. This is because *agrum* has alternative pronunciations: *a-grum*, which leaves the first syllable short, and *ag-rum*, which makes it long. Latin has no such syllable as *agr*. Teach correct syllabification first and everything else will follow.

H. F. GUTE
McMaster University

The Classical Wizard: Magus Mirabilis in Oz. By L. FRANK BAUM. Trans. C. J. HINKE and GEORGE VAN BUREN. Ed. Konrad Gries. Berkeley, CA: Scholar Press, 1987. Pp. 261. Cloth. \$19.95.

It is good fun, re-reading the *Wizard of Oz*, especially in Latin. This is a pretty book, well printed and reproducing illustrations from the original edition in English; it may well become a collector's item for Oz buffs. In general, the translation is faithful and idiomatic, but also quite literal and this involves some oddities like modifiers without connectives, adjacent verbs, gerunds with objects, occasional inventions (e.g., *gasum* for "gas," pp. 204-05), and the use of rare words which you may not find in an abridged Latin dictionary. But a separate glossary is available from the publishers.

There are some ingenious solutions to the problems of vocabulary: "Kansas" is made a "Greek" noun of the first declension in Latin: a "lighted match" is *sulfuratum accensum*; an "umbrella" is *tegumentum pluviale*; a "sun-bonnet," *petasus solaris*; and "spectacles," *perspicilla*. There are minor failures: I doubt that *deduco* (p. 201) should be used of launching a balloon; and *furfureum* (p. 196) despairs of getting the pun on "bran-new."

I commend the translators on a big task nicely completed: Dorothy gets home, and—for some reason—the Tin Woodman never returns to his girl friend, even in Latin. This will make delightful auxiliary reading for pupils already nostalgic about their childhood; and, with permission of the authors, portions of the translation could be dramatized for entertainment in class or at JCL meetings.

VAN L. JOHNSON
San Luis Obispo, California

The Art and Culture of Early Greece, 1100-480 B.C. By JEFFREY M. HURWIT. Ithaca, NY: Cornell Univ. Press, 1985. Pp. 368; 154 illus.; 2 maps. Cloth. \$49.50.

Hurwit's survey of the way certain key concepts, such as time, individuality, order, are manifested and evolve in the archaeological and art historical record of this critically creative period is richly supplemented with evidence from many other areas—literature, philosophy, history, religion, social institutions—that are rarely all included in a single study. The result is a comprehensive and integrated overview of evolving cultural values, accompanied by wide-ranging, stimulating, sometimes speculative interpretations. The treatment of major scholarly questions is clear, informative, and up-to-date. A concise bibliography is supplemented by footnotes providing copious references to primary and secondary sources. The numerous illustrations are instructively chosen and easy to refer to, occasionally frustratingly hard to see. The book presupposes some familiarity with history and the principal texts (at least in translation) and artifacts. For advanced undergraduates and scholar teachers in secondary schools and colleges it offers an informative and enlightening presentation of the current state of knowledge and scholarly theory in a number of fields not usually considered within the compass of one book.

HELEN H. BACON
Barnard College

The Greek City States: A Source Book. By P. J. RHODES. Norman, OK: Univ. of Oklahoma Press, 1986. Pp. xx and 266. Cloth, \$28.50; paper, \$12.95.

"The political institutions of Greek city states, principally Athens and Sparta, in the archaic and classical periods" would be a better title for this collection of ancient sources in translation with commentary. Rhodes' mastery of ancient politics is everywhere visible, but so is a vision which tells the reader virtually nothing about religion, economy, or physical realities, and which practically ends at Chaironeia ("The Greeks under the Romans" get a scant four pages). The snippets are mostly brief, often extracts which a student would find baffling. It would be better to assign the entirety of a few key literary works and some complete inscriptions in translation from the Crawford-Whitehead sourcebook or Fornara's.

Some teachers may find this a convenient assemblage of passages for their own use in class preparation. But I cannot imagine a class for which it is suitable. I circulated it among nine experienced college teachers in my NEH Summer Seminar on the Greek city, and none of them could think of a suitable class use either. This is regrettable, for the translations and notes are generally good (though the latter very conventional in content and occasionally misleading, as in Rhodes' gross overvaluation of the place occupied in archaic Greece by the polis).

ROGER S. BAGNALL
Columbia University

Critical Essays on Homer. By KENNETH ATCHITY, et al., eds. Boston, MA: G. K. Hall, 1987. Pp. viii and 245. Cloth. \$35.

This collection begins with an Introduction written by Atchity and concludes with an annotated Selected Bibliography. In between is a gathering of 16 essays by various scholars, grouped into three parts: On Homer, On the *Iliad*, and On the *Odyssey*. Most have appeared before. There are fine essays by Robert Fitzgerald, Paolo Vivante, Cedric Whitman, George Dimock, James Redfield, Rachel Bepaloff, C. Scott Littleton, John Zarker, Simone Weil, and Norman Austin; and lesser essays by other authors. The whole collection is enlivened with short fiction by Jorge Luis Borges and poems by W. H. Auden, John Donne, Wallace Stevens, and Konstantin Cavafy.

Atchity and his collaborators seek to illustrate the richness and diversity of scholarly and artistic responses to Homer, which they offer as "a foundation for an introductory reading of Homer." Readers coming to Homer for the first time will probably like the energy of this eclectic collection, but more experienced readers are likely to be put off by some of the essays which should have been omitted and by Atchity's Introduction, which is remarkable for the number of questionable statements it contains.

Wm. F. HANSEN
Indiana University, Bloomington

An Introduction to Greek Art. By SUSAN WOODFORD. Ithaca, NY: Cornell Univ. Press, 1986. Pp. xiv and 186; 251 illus; 1 map. Cloth. \$39.50.

Commissioned by the Joint Association of Classical Teachers of Great Britain and originally published in England, this volume is designed primarily for students taking their first course in Greek art. The author's assignment, as she states in her preface, was to focus on a limited number of works of Greek sculpture and vase painting from the late Geometric Period through the end of the fourth century BC "in order to make the beauty of Greek art more readily accessible and comprehensible." Within this limited range Woodford succeeds well. The decision to sacrifice handbook-like comprehensiveness in order to concentrate on a relatively small and carefully selected group of monuments results in an interesting text that is more sophisticated than most introductory books and yet easy to read and comprehend. As one might expect given its purpose, the book does not contain any startlingly new ideas, but it does offer a fluent, well-informed, nicely illustrated version of the conventional wisdom.