

Self to Self

Selected Essays

J. DAVID VELLEMAN

New York University



CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore,
São Paulo, Delhi, Dubai, Tokyo

Cambridge University Press
32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521670241

© J. David Velleman 2006

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,
no reproduction of any part may take place without the written
permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2006
Reprinted 2007

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data

Velleman, James David.

Self to Self : selected essays / J. David Velleman.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 0-521-85429-6 (hardcover) – ISBN 0-521-67024-1 (pbk.)

1. Self. 2. Self (Philosophy) 3. Kant, Immanuel, 1724–1804 – Ethics. I. Title.
BF697.V45 2005
126–dc22 2005008114

ISBN 978-0-521-85429-0 Hardback

ISBN 978-0-521-67024-1 Paperback

Transferred to digital printing 2009

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or
accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet websites referred to in
this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is,
or will remain, accurate or appropriate. Information regarding prices, travel
timetables and other factual information given in this work are correct at
the time of first printing but Cambridge University Press does not guarantee
the accuracy of such information thereafter.

Index

- Abraham, Karl, 135
Achtung, 75, 81
action
 ‘action identification’, 247–8
 for a reason, 7, 249–51
 philosophy of, 14
Adam and Eve: *See* Genesis, Book of
agency
aggression, 135, 136, 138, 140, 142,
 148, 244, 314–16, 319–20, 323,
 348
aim-inhibition, 84, 88
aims, 82, 85, 87–9, 90, 96
Allison, Henry E., 73
ambivalence, 86, 138, 341–7
Anderson, Elizabeth, 88, 98, 99, 101,
 102
Andrews, John D.W., 339, 344
Annas, Julia, 71
Anscombe, G.E.M., 186, 193, 261–3,
 270
Anscombe, Roderick, 339
anticipation, 1–2, 5, 6, 172–3,
 194–202, 354
anxiety, 55, 133, 134, 137, 141, 142,
 146, 148, 155, 157–69
Aronson, Eliot, 228, 232, 240
Arpaly, Nomy, 347, 352
attachment, 109
attribution effect, 215–16, 236–44,
 260
Augustine, Saint, 49–52, 56, 57, 67
Aune, Bruce, 171
authenticity, 338–9
authority, 17–20, 25, 31, 32–3, 35, 43,
 44, 111, 114–19, 122, 123, 125–6,
 127, 130, 131, 132–4, 136–43,
 148–9, 151, 152–5, 157, 336, 337,
 339
autonomy, 1–2, 7–8, 9, 14–15, 33–5,
 43, 44, 126–7, 317, 331–3, 337–9,
 353–4, 357–60
bad faith, 221, 352
Badhwar, Neera Kapur, 71, 102: *See*
 also Kapur, Neera Badhwar
Baier, Annette, 74, 82
Baron, Marcia, 71, 73, 102
belief, 33, 220, 261, 267, 268, 318,
 319, 349
Bem, Daryl, 229–35, 243
benevolence, 86, 95
Benhabib, Seyla, 74, 333
Berkowitz, L., 215, 244
Bermúdez, José-Luis, 276, 279
Bettelheim, Bruno, 82
Blackburn, Simon, 47, 171, 201
blame, 1–2, 157

- Blum, Lawrence, 74, 77
 blushing, 57, 61
 Boër, Stephen E., 175
 Bolen, D., 237
 Borch-Jacobsen, Mikkel, 148
 Brakel, Linda, 315
 Branden, Nathaniel, 76
 Bratman, Michael, 166, 203, 271, 331
 Brewer, Bill, 182
 Brickman, P., 237
 Brodt, S.E., 215
 Brown, Deborah, 104
 Bryant, J., 242
 Butler, Joseph, 111
- Calhoun, Cheshire, 63
 Campbell, John, 180, 186, 191, 201
 Cantor, J.R., 242
 Cantor, N., 356
 Carlsmith, J.M., 227, 228, 235, 240
 Castañeda, Hector-Neri, 184
 categorical imperative, 72, 78, 80,
 112–28, 130–2, 154, 155, 166,
 167, 287, 292, 293, 294, 295,
 302, 304, 305, 306–07, 308, 310,
 328–9: *See also* imperatives,
 categorical
 formula of autonomy, 290
 formula of humanity, 92
 formula of universal law, 6, 92, 131
- Cavell, Marcia, 84
 Cavell, Stanley, 76
 clothing: *See* nakedness
 Cohen, G.A., 298–301, 304, 305
 Coltart, Nina, 77
 conscience, 1, 110–28, 133, 153
 common knowledge, 25, 29, 30, 31,
 32–3, 36, 37–9, 43, 44, 115, 116,
 119, 123, 124, 125, 126, 257, 265,
 268
 communication, 53, 161–2, 163–4,
 259, 267
 conflicting ends, 274, 287–9, 327
 Conly, Sarah, 71
 consequentialism, 71, 159
 constructivism about reasons: *See*
 reasons for acting, constructivism
 about
- contradiction
 in conception, 15, 38, 256, 284
 in the will, 15, 36–40, 256, 284–311
 cooperation, 37, 160–1, 255–8,
 265–73
 cooperative agreement: *See* promising
 Copp, David, 340
 Cottingham, John, 74
- Darwall, Stephen L., 76, 88, 94, 111
 Day, K.D., 242
 decision: *See* intention
 Deigh, John, 46, 71, 129–31, 136, 139,
 143
 Delaney, Neil, 98, 104
 Dennett, Daniel, 8, 180, 203–23, 358
 Dent, N.J.H., 73
 desire, 17–18, 19, 52, 147, 220, 264,
 267, 349
 dignity, 98–9, 101–05, 127, 128
 Dillon, Robin, 76, 82, 102, 332
 dissociative identity disorder: *See*
 multiple personality disorder
 dogs, 52, 54
 Downie, R.S., 88
 Dr. Seuss, 10, 104–5
 dreaming, 350
 drives, 82–5, 130, 144, 314–16,
 319–20
- Eagle, Morris, 345
 Ebbesen, E.B., 234
 ego
 in colloquial sense, 4
 in psychoanalytic sense, 130,
 138–46, 148–9, 152–3
 ego-ideal, 12, 81, 112, 127–8, 131, 138,
 310, 329
 egocentric representation: *See*
 representational scheme,
 egocentric
 Eisenberg, N., 239
 Eliot, George, 253, 280
 Ellison, Ralph, 63
 Elster, Jon, 47, 65
 ends, 40
 persons as, 41–4, 89–96, 154
 ‘self-existent’, 91–3, 98–101

- envy, 168
 Epstein, Mark, 339
 Erikson, Erik, 339
 euthanasia, 42
 Evans, Gareth, 177, 189
 excuses, 21
 expectancy effects, 214, 260

 Fairbairn, W.R.D., 88
 Festinger, L., 227, 228, 235
 fiction, 204–8, 209, 212, 214, 220–2,
 316–20, 321, 348
 first-person, 2–3, 5, 172, 173, 180–9,
 190–4, 195–200, 202, 254, 355,
 358
 Flanagan, Owen, 209, 211, 212, 222
 Foot, Philippa, 285
 Frankfurt, William K. 70, 85, 113, 203,
 246, 330–60
 Fraser, S.C., 239
 free will, 31–5, 52, 57, 60, 218
 Freedman, J.L., 239
 Frege, Gotlob, 175
 Freud, Anna, 348
 Freud, Sigmund, 12, 76, 82–5, 86,
 87, 96, 112–13, 114, 127–8,
 129–55, 157–8, 159, 165, 314–16,
 326, 342–6

 Genesis, Book of, 45–52, 57, 69
Gesetz, 77–81
 Gewirth, Alan, 72
 Gilbert, Margaret, 164
 God, 17, 18, 19, 262
 Green, O.H., 87
 Greenspan, Patricia, 85, 103
 Greenwald, A.G., 214
Groundwork of the Metaphysics of Morals,
 77, 116, 117, 286
 Grusec, J.E., 238
 guilt, 24, 132–8, 156–69
 survivor's, 156, 166, 167–9
 Guyer, Paul, 92

 Hamilton, Andy, 189, 191
 happiness, 41–3
 Hardcastle, Valerie Gray, 209,
 211

 Harman, Gilbert, 197
 Harré, Rom, 355
 hate, 95
 Hawthorne, Nathaniel, 64
 Hegeman, Elizabeth, 47
 'hereby', 199, 213, 219, 221,
 318
 Herman, Barbara, 73
 heteronomy, 33
 Hill, Thomas E., Jr., 92
 Holder, Alexis, 112, 139
 homosexuality, 67, 68–9
 Hume, David, 15, 328
 humility, 60
 Humphrey, Nicholas, 209–11
 Hussain, Nadeem, 282

 identification, 114, 146–8, 331, 334,
 342, 347–54, 359
 identity crisis, 4–5, 356
 imagining, 209, 210, 319–20, 323–5,
 326–8, 349–53
 being another, 170–2, 173, 180–9,
 196, 349–52
 seeing, 179–80, 181
 immunity to error through
 misidentification, 191–2
 impartiality, 70–5, 77
 imperatives
 categorical, 17, 18–20: *See also*
 categorical imperative
 hypothetical, 17, 18, 295
 indexicals, 175–6
 integrity, 4
 intellect, 100
 intention, 196–8, 213, 218, 245–8,
 257–8, 261–2, 268, 269, 270–4
 shared, 164
 'internal' subject: *See* notional subject
 interpretation, 54
 introjection, 113, 131, 133, 134, 135,
 138, 139, 141, 142, 143, 146–8,
 150
 Ishiguro, Hidé, 194

 Jackson, Frank, 72
 Jeske, Diane, 107
 Johnson, Edward, 333, 340

- Johnson, R.C., 242
 Jones, David H., 135
- Kant, Immanuel, 106, 107, 111–28,
 130–2, 155, 166, 167, 192, 256,
 284–311, 328–9
 Kapitan, Tomis, 185
 Kapur, Neera Badhwar, 71, 103: *See*
also Badhwar, Neera Kapur
 Kavka, Gregory, 272
 Kekes, John, 74
 Kihlstrom, J.F., 356
 Klein, Melanie, 135
 ‘knowledge without observation’,
 261–2
 Korsgaard, Christine M., 101, 120, 122,
 124, 203, 286, 296–309, 310, 312,
 340
 Kraut, Robert, 103
 Kravis, Robert, 355
- Lamb, Roger E., 98, 104
 law: *See also* *Gesetz*; respect, for the law
 legal, 16, 158
 moral, 13, 111, 114, 116, 131, 132
 of nature, 34
 universal, 27, 34, 77, 80, 116–26,
 131, 290, 292, 294, 295, 306, 329
 will as a law to itself, 77, 79–81, 91
 Levine, Frederic J., 355
 libido, 82, 97, 144–5, 154, 155, 315,
 316, 326
 Lewis, David K., 175
 Liu, T.J., 235
 love, 1–2, 10–12, 70–109, 128, 132,
 138, 143, 148, 149, 154, 155,
 159–60, 165, 315, 343–6
 romantic, 83–5
 lying, 20, 29–30, 38, 42, 161–2, 251,
 256, 265, 268, 269, 270
 Lycan, William G., 175
 Lyons, William, 85, 103
- McFall, Lynn, 74
 Mackie, John, 171, 181
 Madell, Geoffrey, 175
 Malcolm, Janet, 83
- Martin, Raymond, 172
 Mason, Michelle, 285
 maxims, 27, 28, 72, 78, 79, 80, 120–2,
 123–6, 290, 306, 329
 Meers, Dale, 112, 139
 Mellor, D.H., 174, 276, 279
 memory, 1–2, 5, 6, 173, 187–8,
 189–94, 195, 197, 336, 354
Mensch, 24, 43, 253, 255, 275
 Midgley, Mary, 73
 Miller, R.L., 237
 moral development, 128, 131, 132
 moral skepticism, 153
 moral motivation, 12, 75, 88, 129, 226,
 312–29
 Moran, Richard, 215
 Morris, Herbert S., 135
 ‘motivational set’, 286, 288–9, 291,
 303, 305
 motives, 90–6, 106
 second-order, 94
 Mr. Rogers, 56
 multiple personality disorder, 209–12,
 312, 324
 Murdoch, Iris, 74–7, 82, 84, 86, 95
- Nagel, Thomas, 55, 67, 173–5, 178,
 254, 275, 312
 Nakhnikian, George, 76, 370
 nakedness, 45–52, 55–7, 60, 61, 67
 narrative, 8, 203–23, 249, 250,
 317–18, 327
 naturalism, 14–15
 Neu, Jerome, 95, 102
 Nisbett, R.E., 230
 norm acceptance, 275, 282
 normativity, 282–3, 284, 294, 298,
 301, 304–05, 306, 309
 notional subject, 182, 187–9, 190–4,
 195–200
 Nozick, Robert, 86, 103, 193, 267
 Nussbaum, Martha Craven, 76, 105
 Nuttin, Joseph, 251
- objective representation: *See*
 representational scheme,
 objective

- obligation, 16–17, 18, 20, 110, 304, 305, 309
to self, 156, 166, 167, 296
- O'Brien, Lucy F., 186
- Oldenquist, Andrew, 74
- O'Neill, Onora, 120, 122, 124
- 'one thought too many', 73, 97, 108
- overvaluation, 83–5
- Parfit, Derek, 173, 200, 336–8
- partiality, 96–109: *See also* impartiality
- particularism, 74–5, 98, 105
- Paton, H.J., 73, 91, 94, 116
- Peacocke, Christopher, 178
- Perry, John, 121, 172, 174, 175, 184–5, 186, 254, 275–80, 312
- personal identity, 1, 5–7, 170–202, 222–3, 336–8, 339–41, 353, 355, 357, 359
- personhood, 43–4, 101, 105, 106, 132, 254, 359: *See also* ends, persons as
- perspective: *See also* representational scheme
first-person, 170–202, 254, 255, 336, 358
temporally constant, 22–3, 24, 25, 27, 299–301
universally shared, 25–32, 36, 37–9, 44, 275
visual, 2, 179, 276, 358
- phantasy, 158
- Piper, Adrian M.S., 73
- point-of-view: *See* perspective
- policies 274: *See also* intention
- practical identity, 297–8, 303–06, 308, 309–11, 312
- practical knowledge, 261–3
- practical reason, 284, 287, 288–9, 292, 293, 295, 332: *See also* reasons for acting, 13–14, 154, 261–75
expressive, 267–70
instrumental, 258, 266–70
- practical syllogism, 281, 315
- pretending, 311, 318–20, 321, 326–8, 329, 351
- price, 98–9, 101, 103–04
- pride, 60
- prisoners' dilemma, 36–40, 160–1, 255–8, 265–73, 274
- promising, 117, 120–6, 213, 256, 265–73
- propositional attitudes, 87, 106, 315–16, 349
- proprioception, 277
- psychoanalysis, 83, 152
- punishment, 133–5, 136, 137–8, 139–42, 148, 157–9, 164–5, 244
- quasi-indicators, 184–6
- quasi-memory, 190
- racism, 62–4
- Railton, Peter, 72
- rational nature, 9, 91, 99–101, 106, 132, 154
- Rawls, John, 47, 86
- reasons for acting, 7, 19–33, 40, 43–4, 72, 124–6, 163, 219–20, 250, 264–5, 280–3, 285–96, 297–8, 299, 300–01, 303–11, 318, 326–8
constructivism about, 26–8, 30, 31–3, 35, 36–8, 290–307
- Redler, E., 238
- reflexive mode of presentation: *See* self, as reflexive guise
- representational scheme
egocentric, 5–6, 176–86, 254, 258, 276–8, 279, 358
objective, 3–4, 6, 173–8, 255, 258–61, 271–4, 278–80
- repression, 152, 343–6
- resentment, 95, 157, 167–9
- resolute choice, 270–4
- respect, 75–81
for the law, 12–13, 77–81, 132, 302, 329
for persons, 40–4, 100–01, 106, 127–8, 132, 154, 155
- retaliation, 157, 160–1

- Stark, Cynthia A., 73, 103
 stealing, 20, 28–9, 161
 Steele, C.M., 235
 stereotypes, 62–4, 226
 Stocker, Michael, 47, 71, 88, 97
 Strawson, P.F., 175, 191
 suicide, 42
 Sullivan, Roger J., 120, 122
 super-ego, 128, 129–55, 157
 Swann, William B., Jr., 236, 240
- Taylor, Charles, 203
 Taylor, Gabriele, 46, 47, 85, 103
 Telfer, Elizabeth, 88
 theoretical reasoning, 289–90, 293
 Thomas, Laurence, 85
 Torek, Paul, 172
 toxin puzzle, 272
 Trzebinski, J., 249
 transference, 83–5, 96
 trust, 160–5, 167, 168–9: *See also*
 self-trust
 Turner, C., 244
- universalization, 14, 20, 25–33, 72–3,
 100, 119–26, 166, 294, 306
- Valins, S., 230
 Vallacher, R.R., 246–8, 249, 251,
 260, 263
 ‘valuing as’, 107
 Vendler, Zeno, 171, 178
 virtue, 328
- Vlastos, Gregory, 81, 105
 volitional necessity, 333–6,
 357
- Walton, Kendall L., 320
 weakness of will, 221
 Wegner, D.M., 246–8, 249, 251,
 260, 263
 Weil, Simone, 76, 82
 Westen, Drew, 142
 Whiting, Jennifer, 75, 105
 wholeheartedness, 341–7
 Wiggins, David, 200
 will
 good, 78–81, 90, 100, 161, 162–4,
 165, 167
 rational, 77
 Williams, Bernard, 47, 60, 71, 73,
 74, 97, 98, 108–09, 170, 172,
 173, 179, 183, 186, 201, 285,
 286, 287
 Winnicott, D.W., 76, 95, 338,
 355
 Wittgenstein, Ludwig, 196, 246
 Wolf, Susan, 71
 Wolff, Robert Paul, 333, 340
 Wollheim, Richard, 47, 135, 179, 182,
 349, 351
- Yeats, William Butler, 98
- Zillman, D., 242, 243, 244
 Zillman, E., 215, 242